# REPORT 6 OF THE COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND PUBLIC HEALTH (A-16) Delaying School Start Time to Alleviate Adolescent Sleep Deprivation (Resolution 404-A-15) (Reference Committee D)

#### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

Objectives. Insufficient sleep among adolescents has been a concern for the past several decades. It is recommended that teenagers get 8 to 10 hours of sleep per night, but as adolescents age through middle school and high school, they get progressively less sleep on an average school night. One contributor to insufficient sleep in adolescents is an early school start time. In the past few decades, high school start times have become increasingly early, with many high schools beginning at or before 7:30 a.m. Acknowledging a need to increase alertness and readiness to learn among high school students, many school districts have recently pushed back high school start times. In this report, the Council on Science and Public Health briefly reviews the health and academic consequences of decreased sleep in adolescents and examines more recent evidence for delaying school start times as a mechanism to address adolescent sleep deprivation. This report builds on a 2014 American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP) policy statement entitled "School Start Times for Adolescents."

<u>Data Sources.</u> English language reports published between 2005 and 2016 were selected from a search of the PubMed and Google Scholar databases using the search terms "school start time" and "sleep deprivation" combined with "adolescents," "teenagers," "schools," "students," and "adolescent behavior." Additional articles were identified by manual review of the references cited in these publications. Further information was gathered from a 2014 policy statement issued by the AAP and from Internet sites managed by relevant federal agencies and public health organizations.

Results. The majority of adolescents do not get sufficient sleep (i.e., at least 8 hours) each night. Changes in circadian rhythm and sleep habits due to puberty, night-time distractions, and early school start times all contribute to insufficient sleep among adolescents. Decreased total sleep time among teens is strongly associated with several negative outcomes including decreases in emotional processing and memory, metabolic disorders, impaired immune function, depression and anxiety, high risk behaviors, increased injury from sport activities, unhealthy BMI, and decreased academic performance. Evidence strongly suggests that allowing adolescents more time for sleep results in improvements in health, academic performance, behavior, and general well-being. Overwhelming evidence exists that sleep duration in adolescents can be significantly increased when school start time is delayed, particularly past 8:30 a.m.

<u>Conclusions.</u> Implementing a delayed school start can be an emotional and potentially stressful issue for school districts, families, and members of the community. No "one-size fits all" approach to delaying school start times will be appropriate for all school districts. However, the Council on Science and Public Health believes that the benefits of delaying school start times to allow for adequate sleep among adolescents outweigh the potential negative consequences. The Council believes that physicians, as well as parents and educators, should work together to convey the benefits of increased sleep among teens and support later start times for schools.

#### REPORT OF THE COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

CSAPH Report 6-A-16

Subject: Delaying School Start Time to Alleviate Adolescent Sleep Deprivation

(Resolution 404-A-15)

Presented by: Louis J. Kraus, MD, Chair

Referred to: Reference Committee D

(Michael D. Bishop, MD, Chair)

#### INTRODUCTION

1 2 3

4

Resolution 404-A-15 "Altering School Days to Alleviate Adolescent Sleep Deprivation," introduced by Medical Student Section at the 2015 Annual Meeting of the House of Delegates and referred to the Board of Trustees, asks:

5 6 7

8

That our American Medical Association (AMA) support appropriate entities in establishing clear evidence-based recommendations from existing research on adolescent sleep needs and school start times, and that our AMA support legislation congruent with those guidelines.

9 10 11

Current AMA policy identifies insufficient sleep and sleepiness as a public health issue, and supports education about sleep health as a standard component of care for adolescent patients (Policy H-60.930).

13 14 15

12

#### **METHODOLOGY**

16 17

18

19 20

21

22

English language reports published between 2005 and 2016 were selected from a search of the PubMed and Google Scholar databases using the search terms "school start time" and "sleep deprivation" combined with "adolescents," "teenagers," "schools," "students," and "adolescent behavior." Additional articles were identified by manual review of the references cited in these publications. Further information was gathered from a 2014 policy statement issued by the American Academy of Pediatrics (AAP) and from Internet sites managed by relevant federal agencies and public health organizations.

23 24 25

#### **BACKGROUND**

26 27

28

29

30 31

32

33

Insufficient sleep among adolescents (aged 12-18 years) has been a concern for the past several decades. The AAP recommends that teenagers (aged 14-17 years) get 8.5 to 9.5 hours of sleep per night, and an expert panel convened by the National Sleep Foundation (NSF) recommends that teenagers get 8 to 10 hours of sleep per night. However, in 2013, only approximately 32 percent of teens in grades 9-12 reported getting at least 8 hours of sleep on an average school night.<sup>3</sup> This proportion varied widely by sex, race/ethnicity, and grade level. In addition, approximately 40 percent of 9<sup>th</sup> graders reported at least 8 or more hours of sleep per night, compared to approximately 23 percent of 12<sup>th</sup> graders.<sup>3</sup> Recognizing these patterns as a substantial concern, the

34

© 2016 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.

Action of the AMA House of Delegates 2016 Annual Meeting: Council on Science and Public Health Report 6 Recommendations Adopted as Amended, and Remainder of Report Filed.

topic of "Sleep Health" was incorporated into Healthy People 2020, with a specific objective to increase the overall proportion of students in grades 9-12 who get sufficient sleep (defined as 8 or more hours per night) to 33.1 percent by 2020.4

3 4 5

6 7

8

9 10

11

12

13 14

1 2

> One contributor to insufficient sleep in adolescents is an early school start time. <sup>5-8</sup> In the 1960s, to accommodate a large influx of baby-boomers, school districts began experimenting with staggered start times. By 1975, most high schools in the U.S. started as early as 8:00 a.m. In the past few decades, high school start times have become increasingly early, with many high schools beginning at or before 7:30 a.m. <sup>9,10</sup> Acknowledging a need to increase alertness and readiness to learn among high school students, many school districts have recently pushed back high school start times, and maintained those changes. 11 Delaying high school start times, while beneficial to the student, are often controversial within the school district and community. <sup>12</sup> This report builds on a 2014 AAP policy statement "School Start Times for Adolescents" by briefly reviewing the health and academic consequences of decreased sleep in adolescents and examining more recent evidence for delaying school start times as a mechanism to address adolescent sleep deprivation.

15 16 17

## DECREASED SLEEP AMONG ADOLESCENTS

18 19

The majority of adolescents do not get sufficient sleep (i.e., at least 8 hours) each night. <sup>3,4</sup> Changes in circadian rhythm and sleep habits due to puberty, night-time distractions, and early school start times all contribute to insufficient sleep among adolescents.<sup>5,13</sup>

21 22 23

20

## Circadian rhythm

24 25

26

27

Puberty is accompanied by a biological delay or shift in circadian rhythm, contributing to later bedtimes among teens. 1,14-17 With the onset of puberty, most adolescents experience a sleep/wake "phase delay," resulting in both later sleep and wake times. Pubertal influences on the circadian cycle occur among most mammals, and in humans, are cross-cultural. 13,16

28 29 30

31

32

33

34 35

36

37

38 39

40

Two primary biological factors contribute to changes in sleep regulation during adolescence. First, the secretion of melatonin, a hormone that signals readiness for sleep, is delayed during puberty. <sup>1</sup> On average, melatonin secretion in prepubescent individuals begins at approximately 9:30 p.m., but in adolescents, starts around 10:30 p.m. 11 Therefore, most teens are not ready for melatonintriggered sleep until at least 11:00 p.m. or later. 10,11 The preferred (natural) biological wake-time for 16-year-olds is estimated to be close to 8:00 a.m., while for 18-year-olds is estimated to be closer to 9:00 a.m. This is in contrast to the approximately 6:30 a.m. biological wake time for 10 year-olds. 16 These differences in adolescent biology mean that a 7:00 a.m. wake up time for adolescents is roughly equivalent to a 4:30 a.m. wake-up time for a middle-aged adult. <sup>16</sup> Second, an altered "sleep drive" occurs throughout adolescence, meaning that it can take much longer for teens to fall asleep. Therefore, adolescents undergoing puberty will typically take longer to fall asleep when being awake for 14.5-18.5 hours compared to prepubertal teens.

41 42 43

44

45

46

47

48

The shifting circadian rhythm in teens results in loss of sleep on school days. Total sleep time on school days decreases significantly from ages 11 to 15 years, with 11-year-olds averaging 9 hours, 26 minutes of sleep, and 15-year-olds averaging 7 hours, 55 minutes of sleep. 18 Total sleep time decreases even more as teens get older, with only 23.3 percent of 12<sup>th</sup> graders getting more than 8 hours of sleep on school days.<sup>3</sup> On weekends, adolescents tend to shift bedtimes 1-2 hours later and rise times 1.5-4 hours later than during the week. <sup>14</sup> Although this "catch-up sleep" can partially offset sleep deficits incurred during the week, circadian disruptions persist.<sup>1</sup>

49

50 In a study examining the sleep/wake patterns for the Navy's training camp, young recruits (aged

51 17-19 years) in the training camp were allowed six hours of sleep per night, 10:00 p.m. to 4:00

# CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 3 of 14

a.m. 9,19 In order to address performance issues related to sleep deprivation, bedtime was moved to 9:00 p.m. Despite the extra hour of time allowed for sleep, the recruits were unable to fall asleep and no improvements in performance were noted. However, when sleep times changed from 10:00 p.m. to 6:00 a.m., sleep came more easily and substantial improvements were noted. In particular, standardized test scores increased and sick-calls were reduced by 70 percent. 9,19

6 7 Risk factors

8 9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

1 2

3

4

5

In addition to circadian biology, several factors affect total sleep time among adolescents. Computer and electronic use, family dynamics, and social activities also influence bed time.<sup>20</sup> Night-time use of screen-based technologies (phones, televisions, computers, etc.) impact daytime sleepiness and academic performance. According to the NSF's 2014 Sleep in America Poll, more than 70 percent of adolescents have at least one electronic device in the bedroom.<sup>21</sup> Data from the Pew Research Institute show that over three-quarters of Americans between the ages of 12 and 17 years now own a mobile phone, almost half of which are smartphones.<sup>22,23</sup> Nearly 85 percent of adolescents in the U.S. who have a smartphone sleep with it in or near their bed, and in-bed use has been reported by more than 60 percent of adolescents. <sup>22,24</sup> A recent study of more than 3,000 U.S. middle and high school students found that mobile device use just before bed time or after lightsout is significantly associated with insomnia and daytime sleepiness and is correlated with poor academic performance, later bedtimes and fewer hours of sleep on school nights.<sup>22</sup>

20 21 22

23

24 25 In addition to displacing sleep time, night-time use of some electronics further affects sleep patterns by suppressing melatonin. Exposure to the blue wavelength light found on screen-based technologies is associated with increased alertness and difficulty falling asleep. 16,25,26 The short wavelength spectral light emitted by electronics inhibits the secretion of melatonin, delaying the melatonin-induced sleep process. 13,27

26 27 28

29

30 31 Other social factors such as a negative family environment (defined as an environment with conflict and/or chaos) and stress coping strategies that involve disengagement also impact the ability to fall asleep. <sup>25,28</sup> Additionally, students working part-time jobs for more than 20 hours per week often have difficulty getting adequate sleep. For every 10 hours worked per week outside of school, students lose approximately 14 minutes of sleep per night.<sup>9</sup>

32 33 34

35

36

37

38

School start time is a large contributor to diminished sleep among adolescents. 5-8 Students beginning school before 8:15 a.m. often are substantially sleep deprived.<sup>5</sup> School start times typically remain constant or become earlier as students get older. <sup>25</sup> This is in juxtaposition to the changing sleep patterns and sleep/wake cycles of adolescents as they progress through puberty. <sup>16</sup> The impact of school start times on adolescent health and performance is discussed in more detail later in this report.

39 40 41

## Consequences of sleep deprivation

42 43

44

45

46 47

48

The proper amount of sleep is essential for healthy development during adolescence. Growth hormone is released during slow wave sleep and gonadotrophic hormones also are secreted during sleep. In addition, sleep impacts learning and memory. Adequate rapid eye movement (REM) sleep is essential for emotional processing and cognitive development. Inadequate REM is associated with poor memory performance, mood disorders, daytime sleepiness/unintended sleep, anxiety, decreased socialization, hypersexuality, mental fatigue, and decreased capability of handling complex tasks.<sup>5,9</sup>

49

# CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 4 of 14

Several other negative health effects also are related to short sleep duration. For example, restricted sleep is associated with hypertension and metabolic disorders, including diabetes. <sup>16</sup> Impaired immune function has been linked with short sleep duration; those with diminished sleep are more likely to have an increased susceptibility to viruses such as the common cold. 16,29,30 A study assessing adolescents between the ages of 12 and 17 years found that cortisol levels and white blood cell, neutrophil, monocyte, and CD4+ lymphocyte counts were negatively correlated with short sleep duration.<sup>30</sup> Among females only, short sleep duration also was found to be negatively associated with pro-inflammatory cytokine levels.<sup>30</sup>

Behaviors increasing risk for injury are more prevalent among U.S. high school students who sleep less than 7 hours on an average school night compared to those who sleep 7-10 hours per average school night. These behaviors include infrequent bicycle helmet use, infrequent seatbelt use, riding with a driver who has been drinking, drinking and driving, and texting while driving. A higher risk of injury during after-school sporting activities also appears to be related to decreased sleep duration among adolescents. Between the compared to those who sleep 7-10 hours per average school night.

Adolescents with decreased sleep often are cited as being less physically active. <sup>33,34</sup> Body mass index (BMI) is believed to be directly related to inadequate sleep among adolescents. <sup>16,18,35-38</sup> Adolescents aged 16 to 19 years who are underweight, overweight, or obese have shorter sleep durations than those who are normal weight. <sup>35</sup> However, sex differences in the relationship between obesity and decreased sleep may differ depending on the study design. Obesity is more likely among U.S. adolescent girls getting less than 4 hours of sleep or more than 9 hours of sleep, but these effects were less consistently observed among adolescent boys. <sup>38</sup> In contrast, a more recent study found an association between obesity and short duration of sleep among adolescent boys, but not among adolescent girls. <sup>35</sup>

Generally, a less positive attitude toward life and symptoms of depression and anxiety are more evident with short sleep duration. The association with mood and anxiety is most apparent among those getting less than 6 hours of sleep per night. Adolescents getting less than five hours of sleep per night are more likely to engage in other high risk behaviors, such as smoking, drug use, and high risk sexual activity. An egative or poorly structured family environment, which is itself a risk factor for shorter sleep duration, additionally contributes to these behaviors.

## SCHOOL START TIMES IN THE UNITED STATES

School start times for high school students have become increasingly early over the past several decades. Nearly 10 percent of high schools in the U.S. begin at or before 7:30 a.m. Recently, the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) and the U.S. Department of Education analyzed data from the 2011–2012 Schools and Staffing Survey (SASS). This survey assessed 39,700 public schools (middle, high, and combined schools), with an estimated total enrollment of 26.3 million students. The average start time for all middle, high, and combined schools in the U.S. was 8:03 a.m. Average start time varied widely by state. The average start time for adolescent students in Louisiana is approximately 7:40 a.m., whereas in Alaska and North Dakota, start times are almost an hour later at 8:33 a.m. and 8:31 a.m., respectively. 10,40

School start times vary by state, school size, whether the school is located in urban or rural locations, and the presence and type of the busing system. Schools with more than 1,000 students tend to start approximately 15 minutes earlier compared to smaller schools, and rural schools begin on average 15 minutes later than urban or suburban schools. Schools that do not have a tiered bus system start 15 minutes later than schools with two-tiered systems, or 20 minutes later than schools with three-tiered systems. Several school districts stagger the start times of their elementary,

## CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 5 of 14

middle, and high schools, which accommodates large influxes of students and allows for the same bus drivers to serve multiple schools, thus reducing costs incurred by the school district. 9,41,42

Available data support a high school start time of 8:30 a.m. or later to ensure adequate essential sleep among adolescents. However less than 18 percent of public schools start at or later than 8:30 a.m. This percentage varies widely by state, with more than three-quarters of schools in North Dakota and Alaska starting later than 8:30 a.m., and no schools in Hawaii, Mississippi, or Wyoming starting at or later than 8:30 a.m. 10,40 Forty-two states report that 75-100 percent of their public schools start before 8:30 a.m. 10,40

#### OUTCOMES DUE TO DELAYED SCHOOL START TIMES

As of 2009, more than 80 schools had delayed school start times in an effort to allow adolescents to attain extra sleep. <sup>11</sup> To date, schools in over 43 states have delayed school start times. <sup>43</sup> Several studies, including a systematic review, have evaluated the impact of delayed school start times. <sup>8,44-52</sup> Benefits have been observed by parents, teachers, school administrators, and students, while few disadvantages or harmful effects have been noted. <sup>5,7,12,53</sup> School districts that have delayed start times typically have not returned to their previous schedules. <sup>11</sup>

## Sleep duration

Several studies have compared patterns of sleep duration and the sleep/wake cycle among adolescents with earlier school start times to those with later school start times. One study compared students beginning school at 7:15 a.m. to students beginning school later, at 8:37 a.m.; students at both schools reported similar bedtimes, but students at the school with a later start time woke up an hour later on average on school days than students at the school with the earlier start time. <sup>45</sup> In addition, students at the school with the later start time experienced an average of 50 more minutes of sleep per night and reported less daytime sleepiness compared to their counterparts starting school more than one hour earlier. <sup>45</sup> A three year study that examined the effects of delayed school start times noted that schools starting after 8:30 a.m. allow for almost 60% of students to achieve a sleep duration of at least 8 hours per night on school days, <sup>8</sup> nearly twice the proportion of 9<sup>th</sup>-12<sup>th</sup> grade students currently achieving 8 hours of sleep each night nationwide.<sup>3</sup>

In 1997, citing the negative effects of sleep deprivation, seven Minnesota high schools shifted school start time from 7:15 a.m. to 8:40 a.m. Prior to the change it was anticipated that students would adapt to the change in start time by delaying their bedtime.<sup>5</sup> However, after several years of follow-up, bedtime remained unchanged from the years prior to the change in school start time; as a result, more students had increased total sleep duration each night.<sup>5</sup> Other studies have observed the same, i.e., bedtime remains the same and sleep duration increases with delayed school start time. <sup>13,20,45-48</sup> The average bedtime for teens (approximately 10:30 p.m.) has remained relatively constant for the past several decades. <sup>20</sup> Bedtimes of teens in 1981 were similar to those of bedtimes among teens in 2003-2006 despite drastic changes in school start times within this time frame. <sup>9,11,20</sup>

Evidence that bedtime remains unchanged when school start time is delayed has not been completely consistent. A cross-sectional survey of 7,308 U.S. adolescents aged 13 to 17 years found that those with later school start times went to bed later than students with earlier school start times. <sup>49</sup> Despite this difference, those with later school start times consistently obtained more sleep and were more likely to achieve the recommended 8-10 hours of sleep per night, compared to students attending schools with earlier start times. <sup>49</sup>

## CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 6 of 14

Even modest changes in school start time induce positive changes in sleep duration. For example, a half-hour delay, from 8:00 a.m. to 8:30 a.m. was responsible for students gaining an average of more than 45 minutes of sleep per night. Notably, reports of less than 7 hours of sleep per night were reduced by almost 80%. Others also have observed that a small delay in start time from 8:00 a.m. to 8:25 a.m. was associated with at least one half-hour increase in sleep duration, and more students experiencing at least 8 hours of sleep per school night.

1 2

## Social and physical outcomes

 School districts that have delayed school start times have identified several changes in mood, behavior, and overall well-being among students. In particular, in the time period following institution of delayed start times, students were less likely to have self-reported depression, and more likely to report increased or improved motivation and increased energy level than before the delayed start times were instituted. Parents, teachers, and school administrators in schools with delayed start times also have noted improved student demeanor and significantly fewer disciplinary problems. As a school start times are noted improved student demeanor and significantly fewer disciplinary problems.

Two years following a delay in school start times by one hour in some Kentucky school districts, a notable decrease (16.5 percent) in motor vehicle crash rates among teens was observed in the geographic areas near the schools with delayed start times.<sup>52</sup> In contrast, the motor vehicle crash rate for the rest of Kentucky increased by almost 8 percent during the same time period.<sup>52</sup> This phenomenon has been observed elsewhere as well. In Virginia, teen crash rates were compared between geographically adjacent communities with vastly different high school start times, Virginia Beach, VA, and Chesapeake, VA.<sup>54</sup> School start time in Virginia Beach is 75-80 minutes earlier than in Chesapeake. For the two years studied, crash rates were significantly higher in Virginia Beach compared to Chesapeake.<sup>54</sup> Peak crash times occurred during teens' morning commute timeframe, but other factors, such as congestion rates, were not found to be associated with crash rates.<sup>54</sup> This trend has remained in other counties within the state of Virginia as well.<sup>55</sup> In addition, decreases in motor vehicle crashes among teenagers aged 16-18 years decreased between 65-70 percent after schools in both Minnesota and Wyoming delayed school start times.<sup>7</sup>

#### Extracurricular activities and responsibilities

While positive outcomes have been observed following delays in school start times, negative impacts also have been noted. Later end times to school affect the ability of students to participate in athletic and other extracurricular activities and to have part-time jobs. <sup>9,42</sup> In addition, since it gets dark earlier during the fall and winter months, increased concern exists regarding students waiting for the school bus in the dark. <sup>56,57</sup>

Traditionally, sports practice occurs at the end of the day. The consequent delay of practice and/or start times for games to accommodate a later school start time is a significant concern among parents, students, and coaches. <sup>5,56</sup> Some schools with delayed start times have allowed for early dismissal from class to accommodate scheduling of sports games and practices. <sup>42</sup> In addition, in order to minimize the reduced time allotted for sports practices, other schools have opted to hold practices in the morning, prior to school start, thus negating the reason for delaying school start times. <sup>41,56</sup>

Two studies evaluating the effects of delayed school start times on whether students were too tired to play sports found no significant changes. 43,51,52 Similarly, no significant differences in participation in music activities, volunteer work, or socializing with friends were noted after delayed start times were initiated. 43,51,52

# CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 7 of 14

Teachers also have after-school commitments, and for personal reasons, report mixed support for delayed school start times. <sup>5,12</sup> The majority acknowledge that students are more alert during the day, and many appreciate the extra time in the morning for lesson planning before students arrive. <sup>5</sup> But about half of teachers are concerned that the later end times mean less time for personal commitments, such as having a second job, and longer commutes home due to rush hour traffic. <sup>12</sup>

## Academic performance and attendance

Selected markers of academic performance indicate that decreased sleep duration is associated with poorer academic performance among adolescents. <sup>33,58,59</sup> When school start times are delayed, improvements in academic performance are noted. <sup>8,9,60</sup> Specifically, when classes begin after 8:35 a.m., substantial improvements in grades in math, English, and social studies are observed, and improvements in performance on academic achievement tests at both the state and national level are apparent. <sup>8</sup> In addition, when teens begin school before 8:00 a.m., they tend to perform more poorly throughout the day, compared to teens beginning school later. <sup>59</sup> However, when grades or grade point average (GPA) alone are considered, data on academic performance and school start times are less clear. <sup>8,9,13,57,60</sup> For example, little to no association has been found between GPA and decreased sleep. <sup>57,60</sup> Confounding factors, such as student selection of coursework and specific instructors may bias any association between grades or GPA and decreased sleep.

Improvements to attendance also have been noted when school start time is delayed. Fewer students are tardy or absent from school, and fewer truancies occur. 8,13,15,41,48

## Bus schedule impact

 Costs associated with changes to school bus schedules often are cited as a major reason to not delay school start times. <sup>5,42</sup> However, evidence from school districts that have instituted delays does not support this view. Schools in Minnesota that implemented a change in school start time from 7:15 a.m. to 8:40 a.m. had no changes in transportation costs. <sup>5</sup> In these schools, buses and bus routes remained the same, yet the time the buses used the routes was delayed. <sup>5</sup>

If schools with tiered bus systems opt to dismantle the tiered schedule as a result of later school start times, then increases in transportation costs can be expected. However, the costs may not be as high as previously imagined. Eliminating a three-tiered bus schedule is estimated to cost approximately \$150 per student per year. In contrast, reducing class size by one-third to allow for a more enriched learning environment and an increase in standardized test scores is estimated to cost roughly \$2,151 per student per year, about seven times the cost of eliminating the tiered bus system to accommodate a delayed school start, with an almost equivalent benefit to students. In the school start, with an almost equivalent benefit to students.

## Impacts on family schedules

In school districts considering delaying start times, parents have reported concern about the impact that the later start times could have on their work and family schedules.<sup>5</sup> Some parents have jobs with inflexible start times, so a delay in school start time may require them to arrange for alternative transportation to get their children to and from school. For families with younger siblings, a delay in high school start time may mean that the schedules of younger children will be offset, creating the need for multiple trips to drop off and pick up children from school. Similarly, older siblings are often counted on to provide after-school care for younger siblings, so a shift in school end times may leave parents with the need to find alternative care for those children.<sup>9,42</sup> However, many parents who express concern about the impact of delayed school start times on

## CSAPH Rep. 6-A-16 -- page 8 of 14

their family's schedule still support later start times because of the anticipated positive impact on students' health and learning.<sup>5</sup>

#### **CURRENT LEGISLATION**

In 1998, the Zzz's to A's Act was introduced in the U.S. House of Representatives, advocating for later school start times. Newer versions and revisions have occurred over the past decade and a half. The Act directs the Secretary of Education to study the effect of delaying school start times for adolescents and present the findings to Congress. The Act's sponsor believes that the study will help local school districts to recognize the impact that school start times can have on the well-being of adolescents.<sup>61</sup>

The newest version of the Act, H.R. 1306, was introduced in the House in March of 2015. As of April 2015, it has been referred to the Subcommittee on Early Childhood, Elementary and Secondary Education, which is part of the House Education and Workforce Committee. <sup>62</sup> The Act has several original cosponsors and is supported by both the National Sleep Foundation and Start School Later, Inc. <sup>61</sup>

#### ROLE OF PHYSICIANS, PARENTS, AND EDUCATORS

Adolescent sleep hygiene is highly influenced by parents.<sup>16</sup> Significant concordance exists between parent and adolescent sleep time; adolescents sleep more or less on days in which their parents sleep more or less, respectively.<sup>63</sup> Parents can therefore impact sleep patterns by establishing a sleep routine for the family and by modeling adequate sleep duration and appropriate sleep behavior.<sup>63</sup>

School-based education programs on sleep hygiene have generally improved students' knowledge of appropriate sleep practices, but have resulted in improved sleep behavior only on weekends, not weeknights. However, a positive outcome from one education program was a decrease in behaviors that can negatively impact sleep, such as caffeine intake and hyperactivity.

School administrators, parents, and community members involved in the process of delaying school start times can become overwhelmed by the available data, and the process can be emotionally charged. Lack of sufficient community support to delay start times has led to controversy and worry about the cascade of transportation and athletic/extracurricular activity consequences that could result from a schedule change. Lack of sufficient community support to delay start times has led to controversy and worry about the cascade of transportation and athletic/extracurricular activity consequences that could result from a schedule change.

School start time delays have generally been unsuccessful when only partial facts are explained, implementation is too rapid, and incorrect assumptions are conveyed. Physicians and medical professionals can assist school districts that are considering delaying school start times. The AAP recommends that pediatricians and other health professionals educate adolescents, parents, educators, athletic coaches and other stakeholders about the biological and environmental factors that contribute to sleep deprivation in youth. Further, the AAP recommends that health professionals provide scientific information, evidence-based rationales, guidance, and support to educate school administrators, parent-teacher associations, and school boards about the benefits of instituting a delay in start times as a potentially highly cost-effective countermeasure to adolescent sleep deprivation and sleepiness. The presence of physicians, particularly sleep medicine specialists and pediatricians, at public meetings on delaying school start times has been influential. In Kentucky, support from a child psychologist and the school's legal counsel were helpful in the decision to delay school start times. The professionals has been similarly influential. In Kentucky, support from a child psychologist and the school's legal counsel were helpful in the decision to delay school start times.

## CONCLUSIONS

Adolescent sleep health is an important public health topic. Decreased total sleep time among teens is strongly associated with several negative outcomes including decreases in emotional processing and memory, metabolic disorders, impaired immune function, depression and anxiety, high risk behaviors, increased injury from sport activities, unhealthy BMI, and decreased academic performance. Evidence strongly suggests that allowing adolescents more time for sleep results in improvements in health, academic performance, behavior, and general well-being. Overwhelming evidence exists that sleep duration in adolescents can be significantly increased when school start time is delayed, particularly past 8:30 a.m. Topics, 47-51,69 The AAP and the National Association of School Nurses and the Society of Pediatric Nurses support a delay in school start times to allow more adolescents to achieve the recommended sleep duration of 8-10 hours per night.

Implementing a delayed school start can be an emotional and potentially stressful issue among members of the community. No "one size fits all" approach to delaying school start times will be appropriate for all school districts. <sup>12</sup> However, the Council on Science and Public Health believes that the benefits of delaying school start times to allow for adequate sleep among adolescents outweigh the potential consequences. The Council believes that physicians, as well as parents and educators, should work together to convey the benefits of increased sleep among teens and support later start times for schools.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

The Council on Science and Public Health recommends that the following statements be adopted in lieu of Res 404-A-15 and the remainder of the report be filed.

That our American Medical Association:

 Encourage school districts to aim for the start of middle schools and high schools to be no earlier than 8:30 a.m., in order to allow adolescents time for adequate sleep. (New HOD Policy)

2. Encourage physicians, especially those who work closely with school districts, to become actively involved in the education of parents, school administrators, teachers, and other members of the community to stress the importance of sleep and consequences of sleep deprivation among adolescents, and to encourage school districts to structure school start times to accommodate the biologic sleep needs of adolescents. (New HOD Policy)

3. Reaffirm Policy H-60.930, Insufficient Sleep in Adolescents, identifying adolescent insufficient sleep and sleepiness as a public health issue and supporting education about sleep health as a standard component of care for adolescent patients. (Reaffirm HOD Policy)

4. Encourage continued research on the impact of sleep on adolescent health and academic performance. (New HOD Policy)

Fiscal note: Less than \$500

#### REFERENCES

- 1. American Acadamy of Pediatrics. School start times for adolescents. *Pediatrics*. 2014;134(3):642-9.
- 2. Hirshkowitz M, Whiton K, Albert SM, et al. National Sleep Foundation's sleep time duration recommendations: methodology and results summary. *Sleep Health*. 2015;1(1):40-3.
- 3. Kann L, Kinchen S, Shanklin SL, et al. Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance 2013. *MMWR Surveill Summ.* June 13, 2014;63(4):1-47.
- 4. HealthyPeople 2020. Sleep Health. http://www.healthypeople.gov/2020/topics-objectives/topic/sleep-health/objectives. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 5. Wahlstrom K. Changing times: Findings from the first longitudinal study of later high school start times. *NASSP Bulletin.* 2002;86(633):3-21.
- 6. Dexter D, Bijwadia J, Schilling D, Applebaugh G. Sleep, sleepiness and school start times: a preliminary study. *WMJ*. 2003;102(1):44-6.
- 7. Wahlstrom K. School start time and sleepy teens. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med.* 2010;164(7):676-7.
- 8. Wahlstrom K, Dretzke B, Gordon M, et al. Examining the impact of later high school start times on the health and academic performance of high school students: A multi-site study. 2014. http://conservancy.umn.edu/handle/11299/162769. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 9. O'Malley EB, O'Malley MB. Chapter 7: School Start Time and Its Impact on Learning and Behavior. In Ivanenko, A ed. *Sleep and psychiatric disorders in children and adolescents*. CRC Press; 2008.
- National Center for Education Statistics. Schools and Staffing Survey. Average start time for public high schools and percentage distribution of start times in public high schools, by selected school characteristics: 2011–12.
   <a href="https://nces.ed.gov/surveys/sass/tables/sass1112">https://nces.ed.gov/surveys/sass/tables/sass1112</a> 201381 s1n.asp. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 11. Lamberg L. High schools find later start time helps students' health and performance. *JAMA*. 2009;301(21):2200-1.
- 12. Wahlstrom KL. The prickly politics of school starting times. *Phi Delta Kappan*. 1999;80:344-7.
- 13. Owens J, Adolescent Sleep Working Group, Committee on Adolescence. Insufficient sleep in adolescents and young adults: an update on causes and consequences. *Pediatrics*. 2014;134(3):e921-32.
- 14. Crowley SJ, Acebo C, Carskadon MA. Sleep, circadian rhythms, and delayed phase in adolescence. *Sleep Med.* 2007;8(6):602-12.

- 15. Hagenauer MH, Perryman JI, Lee TM, Carskadon MA. Adolescent changes in the homeostatic and circadian regulation of sleep. *Dev Neurosci*. 2009;31(4):276-84.
- 16. Kelley P, Lockley SW, Foster RG, Kelley J. Synchronizing education to adolescent biology: let teens sleep, start school later'. *Learning, Media and Technology*. 2015;40(2):210-26.
- 17. Hasler BP, Clark DB. Circadian misalignment, reward-related brain function, and adolescent alcohol involvement. *Alcohol Clin Exp Res.* 2013;37(4):558-65.
- 18. Leger D, Beck F, Richard JB, Godeau E. Total sleep time severely drops during adolescence. *PLoS One*. 2012;7(10):e45204.
- 19. Miller L, Dyche J, Andrews C, Lucus T. The impact of additional sleep on test scores at U.S. Navy boot camp. *Sleep*. 2004;27:A164.
- 20. Knutson KL, Lauderdale DS. Sociodemographic and behavioral predictors of bed time and wake time among US adolescents aged 15 to 17 years. *J Pediatr*. 2009;154(3):426-30.
- 21. National Sleep Foundation. 2014 Sleep in America Poll.

  <a href="https://sleepfoundation.org/sites/default/files/2014-NSF-Sleep-in-America-poll-summary-of-findings---FINAL-Updated-3-26-14-.pdf">https://sleepfoundation.org/sites/default/files/2014-NSF-Sleep-in-America-poll-summary-of-findings---FINAL-Updated-3-26-14-.pdf</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 22. Polos PG, Bhat S, Gupta D, et al. The impact of Sleep Time-Related Information and Communication Technology (STRICT) on sleep patterns and daytime functioning in American adolescents. *J Adolesc*. 2015;44:232-44.
- 23. Madden M, Lenhart A, Duggan M, Cortesi S. Gasser, U. Teens and technology 2013. Pew Research Center. 2013. <a href="http://www.pewinternet.org/2013/03/13/teens-and-technology-2013">http://www.pewinternet.org/2013/03/13/teens-and-technology-2013</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 24. Lenhart A, Ling R, Campbell S, Purcell K. Teens and mobile phones. Pew Research Center. 2010. <a href="http://www.pewinternet.org/2010/04/20/teens-and-mobile-phones">http://www.pewinternet.org/2010/04/20/teens-and-mobile-phones</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 25. Bartel KA, Gradisar M, Williamson P. Protective and risk factors for adolescent sleep: A meta-analytic review. *Sleep Med Rev.* 2015;21:72-85.
- 26. Gamble AL, D'Rozario AL, Bartlett DJ, et al. Adolescent sleep patterns and night-time technology use: results of the Australian Broadcasting Corporation's Big Sleep Survey. *PLoS One*. 2014;9(11):e111700.
- 27. American Medical Association Council on Science and Public Health. Report 4-A-12. Light Pollution: Adverse Health Effects of Nighttime Lighting. <a href="http://www.ama-assn.org/ama/pub/about-ama/our-people/ama-councils/council-science-public-health/reports/2012-reports.page">http://www.ama-assn.org/ama/pub/about-ama/our-people/ama-councils/council-science-public-health/reports/2012-reports.page</a>. Accessed March 24, 2016.
- 28. Matthews KA, Hall MH, Cousins J, Lee L. Getting a Good Night's Sleep in Adolescence: Do Strategies for Coping With Stress Matter? *Behav Sleep Med*. 2015;15:1-11.
- 29. Prather AA, Janicki-Deverts D, Hall MH, Cohen S. Behaviorally Assessed Sleep and Susceptibility to the Common Cold. *Sleep.* 2015;38(9):1353-9.

- 30. Perez-de Heredia F, Garaulet M, Gomez-Martinez S, et al. Self-reported sleep duration, white blood cell counts and cytokine profiles in European adolescents: the HELENA study. *Sleep Med.* 2014;15(10):1251-8.
- 31. Wheaton AG, Olsen EO, Miller GF, Croft JB. Sleep Duration and Injury-Related Risk Behaviors Among High School Students United States, 2007-2013. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2016;65(13):337-41.
- 32. Milewski MD, Skaggs DL, Bishop GA, et al. Chronic lack of sleep is associated with increased sports injuries in adolescent athletes. *J Pediatr Orthop.* 2014;34(2):129-33.
- 33. Stea TH, Knutsen T, Torstveit MK. Association between short time in bed, health-risk behaviors and poor academic achievement among Norwegian adolescents. *Sleep Med.* 2014;15(6):666-71.
- 34. McKnight-Eily LR, Eaton DK, Lowry R, et al. Relationships between hours of sleep and health-risk behaviors in US adolescent students. *Prev Med.* 2011;53(4):271-3.
- 35. Suglia SF, Kara S, Robinson WR. Sleep duration and obesity among adolescents transitioning to adulthood: Do results differ by sex? *J Pediatr*. 2014;165(4):750-4.
- 36. Sivertsen B, Pallesen S, Sand L, Hysing M. Sleep and body mass index in adolescence: results from a large population-based study of Norwegian adolescents aged 16 to 19 years. *BMC Pediatr*. 2014;14(1):204.
- 37. Meldrum RC, Restivo E. The behavioral and health consequences of sleep deprivation among US high school students: Relative deprivation matters. *Prev Med.* 2014;63:24-8.
- 38. Lowry R, Eaton DK, Foti K, et al. Association of sleep duration with obesity among US high school students. *J Obes*. 2012;2012:476914.
- 39. Perkinson-Gloor N, Lemola S, Grob A. Sleep duration, positive attitude toward life, and academic achievement: the role of daytime tiredness, behavioral persistence, and school start times. *J Adolesc.* 2013;36(2):311-8.
- 40. Wheaton AG, Ferro GA, Croft JB. School Start Times for Middle School and High School Students United States, 2011–12 School Year. *MMWR Morb Mortal Wkly Rep.* 2015;64(30):809-13.
- 41. Edwards F. Early to rise? The effect of daily start times on academic performance. *Economics of Education Review*. 2012;31(6):970-83.
- 42. Kirby M, Maggi S, D'Angiulli A. School Start Times and the Sleep–Wake Cycle of Adolescents A Review and Critical Evaluation of Available Evidence. *Educational Researcher*. 2011;40(2):56-61.
- 43. Start School Later, Inc. Success Stories. http://www.startschoollater.net/success-stories.html. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 44. Minges KE, Redeker NS. Delayed school start times and adolescent sleep: A systematic review of the experimental evidence. *Sleep Med Rev.* 2015;28:82-91.

- 45. Wolfson AR, Spaulding NL, Dandrow C, Baroni EM. Middle school start times: the importance of a good night's sleep for young adolescents. *Behav Sleep Med.* 2007;5(3):194-209.
- 46. Vedaa O, Saxvig I, Wilhelmsen-Langeland A, Bjorvatn B, Pallesen S. School start time, sleepiness and functioning in Norwegian adolescents. *Scandinavian J Educ Res.* 2012;56(1):55-67.
- 47. Short MA, Gradisar M, Lack LC, et al. A cross-cultural comparison of sleep duration between US And Australian adolescents: the effect of school start time, parent-set bedtimes, and extracurricular load. *Health Educ Behav*. 2013;40(3):323-30.
- 48. Lufi D, Tzischinsky O, Hadar S. Delaying school starting time by one hour: some effects on attention levels in adolescents. *J Clin Sleep Med*. 2011;7(2):137-43.
- 49. Paksarian D, Rudolph KE, He JP, Merikangas KR. School Start Time and Adolescent Sleep Patterns: Results From the US National Comorbidity Survey—Adolescent Supplement. *Am J Public Health*. 2015;105(7):1351-7.
- 50. Owens JA, Belon K, Moss P. Impact of delaying school start time on adolescent sleep, mood, and behavior. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med.* 2010;164(7):608-14.
- 51. Boergers J, Gable CJ, Owens JA. Later school start time is associated with improved sleep and daytime functioning in adolescents. *J Dev Behav Pediatr*. 2014;35(1):11-7.
- 52. Danner F, Phillips B. Adolescent sleep, school start times, and teen motor vehicle crashes. *J Clin Sleep Med.* 2008;4(6):533-5.
- 53. Start School Later, Inc. Reports and Case Studies: How Have Schools Managed to Delay Bell Times? http://www.startschoollater.net/case-studies.html. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 54. Vorona RD, Szklo-Coxe M, Wu A, et al. Dissimilar teen crash rates in two neighboring southeastern Virginia cities with different high school start times. *J Clin Sleep Med*. 2011;7(2):145-51.
- 55. Vorona RD, Szklo-Coxe M, Lamichhane R, et al. Adolescent crash rates and school start times in two central Virginia counties, 2009-2011: a follow-up study to a southeastern Virginia study, 2007-2008. *J Clin Sleep Med.* 2014;10(11):1169-77.
- 56. Hamiduzzaman S, Phillips B. High school start times and death on the road. *J Clin Sleep Med*. 2014;10(11):1179-80.
- 57. Eliasson A, Eliasson A, King J, Gould B, Eliasson A. Association of sleep and academic performance. *Sleep Breath* 2002;6(1):45-8.
- 58. Perez-Lloret S, Videla AJ, Richaudeau A, et al. A multi-step pathway connecting short sleep duration to daytime somnolence, reduced attention, and poor academic performance: an exploratory cross-sectional study in teenagers. *J Clin Sleep Med.* 2013;9(5):469-73.
- 59. Ming X, Koransky R, Kang V, et al. Sleep insufficiency, sleep health problems and performance in high school students. *Clin Med Insights Circ Respir Pulm Med*. 2011;5:71-9.

- 60. Carrell SE, Maghakian T, West JE. A's from Zzzz's? The causal effect of school start time on the academic achievement of adolescents. *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy*. 2011;3(3):62-81.
- 61. U.S.House of Representatives. Lofgren introduces Zzz's to A's Act to protect student health, well-being, and performance. https://lofgren.house.gov/news/documentsingle.aspx?DocumentID=397886. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 62. Congress.gov. H.R. 1306: ZZZ's to A's Act. Available at: https://www.congress.gov/bill/114th-congress/house-bill/1306. Accessed February 15, 2016.
- 63. Fuligni AJ, Tsai KM, Krull JL, Gonzales NA. Daily concordance between parent and adolescent sleep habits. *J of Adolesc Health*. 2015;56(2):244-50.
- 64. Kira G, Maddison R, Hull M, Blunden S, Olds T. Sleep education improves the sleep duration of adolescents: a randomized controlled pilot study. *J Clin Sleep Med.* 2014;10(7):787-92.
- 65. Wing YK, Chan NY, Man Yu MW, et al. A School-Based Sleep Education Program for Adolescents: A Cluster Randomized Trial. *Pediatrics*. 2015;135(3):e635-e643.
- 66. Minneapolis Star Tribune. Wayzata schools debate start times. <a href="http://www.startribune.com/wayzata-schools-debate-start-times/330439211/">http://www.startribune.com/wayzata-schools-debate-start-times/330439211/</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 67. Portland Press Herald. Later start times for southern Maine middle and high schools proposed. <a href="http://www.pressherald.com/2016/02/16/later-start-times-for-southern-maine-middle-and-high-schools-proposed/">http://www.pressherald.com/2016/02/16/later-start-times-for-southern-maine-middle-and-high-schools-proposed/</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 68. Connecticut News Junkie. School Officials Want The State To Take The Lead On Changing School Start Times.

  <a href="http://www.ctnewsjunkie.com/archives/entry/school\_officials\_want\_the\_state\_to\_take\_the\_lead\_on\_changing\_school\_start\_t/">http://www.ctnewsjunkie.com/archives/entry/school\_officials\_want\_the\_state\_to\_take\_the\_lead\_on\_changing\_school\_start\_t/</a>. Accessed February 16, 2016.
- 69. Fogg N, Johnson A. Child and Adolescent Sleep Patterns and Early School Start Times: Recognizing the Role of the Pediatric Nurse. *J Pediatr Nurs*. 2015;30(4):628-31.